

#### **Mayor** Oscar Leeser

# HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES FIRST FLOOR, CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS CITY 1 BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL STREET FEBRUARY 23, 2015, 4:00 P.M.

#### **City Council**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the City Council Chambers, First Floor, City 1 Building, February 23, 2015, 4:00 p.m.

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

The following commissioners were present:

District 2
Larry Romero

Vice-Chairman Edgar Lopez Commissioner Beatriz Lucero

Chairman William Helm II

District 3
Emma Acosta

Commissioner Randy Brock Commissioner John Moses Commissioner Cesar Gomez

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

The following City staff members were present:

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic Development Ms. Karla Nieman, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

# **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairman Helm called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m., quorum present.

District 7 Lily Limón

# **CHANGES TO THE AGENDA**

None.

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

# I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

#### II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION

## **City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

Certificate of Appropriateness

**1. PHAP15-00006:** Being 24 Sunset Heights 8 & E. 1/2 Of 9, City of El Paso, El Paso

County, Texas

Location: 711 Upson Drive
Historic District: Sunset Heights
Property Owner: Ryan Kerr
Representative: Marilyn Del Rio

Representative District: 8

Existing Zoning: R-5/H (Residential/Historic)

Year Built: 1930

**Economic & International Development** 

City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094

ED@elpasotexas.gov

Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



# Mayor

Oscar Leeser

#### **City Council**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

# **Economic & International Development Department**

Historic Status: Contributing

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a detached

garage

Application Filed: 2/9/15 45 Day Expiration: 3/26/15

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a detached garage. The property is located approximately in the center of the block. A photo of the property, taken from a survey completed 14 years ago shows the property in disrepair.

Ms. Velázquez explained the previous owner had extensive work done to the structure without proper permits or approvals. Only after Code Compliance staff cited the property owner did the property owner come in to speak with her. From that meeting, the property owner brought the structure back into compliance.

From the photos, this main structure is rather elevated from the street and sidewalk; therefore, the proposed detached garage will not be visible from the main façade. The proposed garage will be in the rear of the property with the garage wall set on the main property line facing the alleyway.

This will be a very basic, one story garage with a stucco façade with the garage door facing the alleyway. The aerial photograph showed a structure located in the rear of the property; however, the previous owner must have removed that during one of his renovation projects. Recent photographs show leftover rubble from that demolition and temporary orange fencing. Ms. Velázquez highlighted there are other garages located within this same alley. This is not an unusual request; commissioners will not be setting any precedence. Photos of adjacent properties reiterate the garage would not be visible from the main façade.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- Most of the older structures in El Paso have parking provided at the rear of the property in a garage or carport structure. Every effort should be taken to maintain the use of the original parking areas. When repair or replacement is required the existing structure (garage or driveway) should be replaced in kind,
- Design new garages and outbuildings to be compatible with the main structure on the lot in material and design, using existing historic outbuildings in the districts as an example.
- Limit the size and scale of garages and accessory structures so that the integrity of the original structure, or the size of the existing lot, is not compromised or significantly diminished.
- New garages and accessory buildings should be located in rear yards.



# **City Council**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

# **City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

# **Economic & International Development Department**

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be impaired.

Chairman Helm asked if the property owner or representative was present.

Chairman Helm asked Ms. Velázquez if the proposed plans had been reviewed by other city staff besides herself.

Ms. Velázquez understood the plans were in the Building Permits and Inspections Department for review. Due to the setbacks, Zoning Department staff will also review the plans.

Ms. Del Rio, DRS Architecture, explained the original garage was built to the property line; however, it was demolished some time ago. The new garage must comply with the five foot setback requirements. We are asking for a special condition from the Zoning Department to construct the garage away from the setback otherwise the garage would cover the entire rear yard of the property. The proposed plans will be presented to the City Plan Commission for their review and approval at the meeting next month.

Commissioner Gomez asked Ms. Del Rio what color the proposed garage would be.

Ms. Del Rio replied, white, the property owner would like the garage painted identical to the main structure.

Chairman Helm asked Ms. Velázquez if her recommendations required any changes to the proposed design.

Ms. Velázquez responded no, the design was fine. The garage will be located in the rear of the property and not visible from the main façade.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Ms. Del Rio if she had demolished the previous garage without a permit.



### Mayor

Oscar Leeser

#### **City Council**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

*District 7* Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

# City Manager Tommy Gonzalez

# **Economic & International Development Department**

Ms. Del Rio responded no, the structure was demolished prior to the current property owner purchasing the property.

Vice-Chairman Lopez had no issues or concerns regarding the request. He reiterated the proposed garage would have a stucco exterior and be painted white to match the main structure.

#### **MOTION:**

Motion made by Vice-Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Moses AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE GARAGE FOR 711 UPSON DRIVE.

2. PHAP15-00007: Being Fr. 7 Alexander 9 & 10, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas

Location: 1319 N. El Paso Street

Historic District: Sunset Heights
Property Owner: The Venice Group
Representative: Carlos Silveyra

Representative District: 8

Existing Zoning: A-3/H (Apartment/Historic)

Year Built: 1930

Historic Status: Non-contributing

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal and replacement

of doors and windows and the installation of through-wall grilles

after-the fact

Application Filed: 2/9/15 45 Day Expiration: 3/26/15

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal and replacement of doors and windows and the installation of through-wall grilles after-the-fact. Ms. Velázquez pointed out the property is located at the very edge of the historic district. The presentation photographs will show properties within the historic district and not the properties across the street that are outside the historic district boundaries.

Ms. Velázquez presented a photo of the property. The photo was taken in 2000, the last time the city conducted a survey of historic district properties. The structure was very minimal and most of the character of the property came from the fenestration and from the doors.



# Mayor

Oscar Leeser

#### **City Council**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

# **DISCOVERY**

Ms. Velázquez received notice renovations to the exterior were in progress, without proper approvals or permits, and went to investigate. By this time, the property owner had replaced all the doors and windows. Ms. Velázquez met with the property owner when he came to her office to discuss options.

#### **OPTIONS**

While in her office, Ms. Velázquez explained the property owner could put the original doors and windows back where they were; however, if the property owner insisted on keeping these changes he would have to come before the Historic Landmark Commission.

#### THROUGH-WALL GRILLES

Ms. Velázquez explained the property owner has proposed through-wall grilles with locations for new grilles in different spots.

#### DOORS - PROPOSAL FROM PROPERTY OWNER

Rather than replacing the original doors, which were two weak French doors, the property owner has proposed a single door with multi-lights and two panels underneath, in each of the openings.

Ms. Velázquez showed photographs of the doors at rear of the property, recent and from 2000, and explained the property owner is proposing to install the same type door as shown in the recent photograph.

#### **WINDOWS**

The property owner is proposing to use Ply Gem, vinyl windows.

#### CHANGING THE CHARACTER OF THE PROPERTY

Although the property owner has proposed basic changes from what is existing, those changes do not match quite exactly what was there before. It will change the character of the property somewhat.

Ms. Velázquez showed photos of adjoining structures, some alterations have been done; however, the character of these structures remains.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **DENIAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- Doors and windows are considered important character-defining features because of significant detailing.
- When windows are involved in the construction process it is recommended to repair rather than replace.

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov

Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



# **City Council**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

# **City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

# **Economic & International Development Department**

- However, if windows are damaged beyond repair, replacement windows should match the type (such as double hung), style (for example six panes over six panes), and finish (paint). Replacement windows on the main façade shall be comprised of the operable portions of the window and match the type, style, operation, configuration and finish of the original windows.
- Do not use single pane picture windows or horizontal sliding windows if they are not the original window types.
- Installation of windows similar to the original in appearance and structural purpose, regardless of construction materials is permitted.
- Windows in secondary façades shall be reviewed on a case by case basis.
- The size of the door or window opening should not be altered. New doors and windows should be constructed to fit into the existing opening,
- Retain and preserve the pattern, arrangement, and dimensions of door and window openings on principal elevations. Often the placement of doors and windows is an indicator of a particular architectural style, and therefore contributes to the building's significance. Doors and windows for new construction and additions should be compatible in proportion, location, shape, pattern, size, and details to existing units.
- Retain and preserve original doors and windows, including such elements as sash, glass, sills, lintels, casings, muntins, trim, frames, thresholds, hardware and shutters. If repair of an original window or door element is necessary, repair only the deteriorated element to match the original in size, composition, material, dimension, and detail by patching, splicing, consolidating, or otherwise reinforcing the deteriorated section. The removal of historic materials should be avoided.
- When repair is not feasible, door and window products will be reviewed on an individual basis using the following criteria:
  - a. Architectural and historical compatibility;
  - b. Comparison to original profile;
  - c. Level of significance of original doors and windows to the architectural style of the building;
  - d. Three dimensional exterior applied muntins that simulate or match the original muntins may be approved. Single dimension interior applied muntins are not appropriate.
- For commercial and/or institutional buildings, or the replacement of steel casement windows, if it is not feasible to repair original windows, select replacement products that are compatible in proportion, location, shape, pattern, size, and details to the original window component.
- Visible door styles must be matched to the building's architectural style. An inappropriate door will require review by the HLC.
- If a new mechanical system is needed, install it so that it causes the least amount of alteration to the building's exterior façades, historic building fabric, and site features.
- Locate new mechanical equipment and utilities, including heating and air-conditioning units, meters, exposed pipes, and fuel tanks, in the most inconspicuous areas, usually a building's rear façade, screened from public view.



#### **City Council**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

# **Economic & International Development Department**

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- The removal of distinctive materials or alterations of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
- Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
- Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

Chairman Helm asked if the property owner or representative was present.

Mr. Carlos Silveyra, property owner, apologized to commissioners saying he was not aware the property was located within a historic district. He asked commissioners for their assistance, suggestions to resolve these door, window, and through-wall grill issues.

#### PROPERTY LOCATED IN HISTORIC DISTRICT

He purchased the property via Housing Authority auction. The property is comprised of four studios and two regular sized apartments which he planned to rent out.

Chairman Helm asked Mr. Silveyra when he purchased the property was he not informed the property was located in a historic district.

Mr. Silveyra explained he thought it was just the paint and the colors, he did not know about the historic district. He bought the property from the Housing Authority of the City of El Paso; the structure had deteriorated and needed much repair. When he purchased the property, the lower studio apartments were boarded up; some doors were missing, others were broken. The property was abandoned for many years and had completely deteriorated.

#### CHANGING THE CHARACTER OF THE PROPERTY

Vice-Chairman Lopez stated Mr. Silveyra had destroyed whatever could have been rescued from the house. Removing the doors and making them 3-0/6-0 residential, changed the whole perspective, the look of the house. Vice-Chairman Lopez stated he was more concerned about the doors, than the windows. The windows could be rescued; however, the doors are just atrocious.



#### **Mayor** Oscar Leeser

# CHANGING THE CHARACTER OF THE PROPERTY – DOORS

Vice-Chairman Lopez noted the doors were previously eight feet high but have been drastically shortened; the proportion is lost completely. Commissioners would never have approved something like this, changing the character of the property by changing the size of the doors.

# **City Council**

# **RENOVATIONS - WINDOWS**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

When he purchased the property, Mr. Silveyra explained some windows would open but others were just a pane of glass. *He proposed installing a wood frame for the windows.* 

District 2
Larry Romero

From the presentation photos, Chairman Helm asked Mr. Silveyra how much of the renovations he had completed, specifically, had Mr. Silveyra replaced all the windows.

District 3
Emma Acosta

Mr. Silveyra responded yes, he removed all previous windows and replaced with energy efficient windows.

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

Per the photographs, Chairman Helm asked Mr. Silveyra what the dark color around the windows was.

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

Mr. Silveyra explained that was the paper and the mesh before the contractors attach the concrete and stucco.

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

Chairman Helm asked if there was a photograph of the original windows.

District 7 Lily Limón Ms. Velázquez responded no, unfortunately we do not have a photo.

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

(Ms. Velázquez distributed the photos of the windows to commissioners for review.)

Mr. Silveyra said he had brought some photos of the windows at the time of purchase.

#### RENOVATIONS – WINDOWS – PROPOSED VIEW

Chairman Helm asked if the picture was of the proposed view.

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

Mr. Silveyra replied yes, that is the proposed view.

Commissioner Gomez clarified so right here all you are doing is adding the frame.

Mr. Silveyra replied the frame, yes sir, those were basically exactly the same.



# **Economic & International Development Department**

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Mr. Silveyra to clarify what he proposed to do with the windows; for example, what will the trim molding be?

Mr. Silveyra proposed a solid wood frame around it like the one ...

Vice-Chairman Lopez continued leaving the existing windows that you have right now.

Mr. Silveyra responded yes sir, these windows are double paned, energy efficient windows. The previous, older windows were just single paned.

Vice-Chairman Lopez clarified those are on the face of the wall, not in the middle of the wall as shown.

Mr. Silveyra responded all of the windows are on the face, correct. When he purchased the property, the windows were set back a couple of inches. If permissible, we can do that, no problem. Additionally, we can put molding around and make it look exactly as it was. The windows on the other side were set back a couple of inches. If permissible, we can do that and put the exact same moldings on those. *The proportions were not modified on the windows*. On this side it is exactly like they were. We changed the single pane and broken windows to the double pane, energy efficient windows.

Chairman Helm asked Mr. Silveyra if the photos represent the work he had already done, on the ground floor, or were those new windows.

Mr. Silveyra replied those are new, the windows were replaced but the proportion has not been changed. The contractors had to scratch some of the concrete to even them out. As you can see, the two black holes were where the old a/c window units were located. We are proposing to patch that.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Mr. Silveyra if he would be installing wood molding.

Mr. Silveyra responded solid wood like it used to have, yes sir.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Mr. Silveyra if those were bedrooms at street level.

Mr. Silveyra explained there are four small studio apartments on the bottom and two apartments on the top.

Comparing the before and after renovation photos, Vice-Chairman Lopez noted there is not that much to do with this façade.

# **City Council**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez



**Mayor** Oscar Leeser Mr. Silveyra agreed the windows were pretty much the same.

Vice-Chairman Lopez commented on the moldings.

Mr. Silveyra replied yes sir; and the solid wood moldings like it was, yes sir.

Vice-Chairman Lopez clarified all the moldings with which they have a concern with the ones facing the street, both streets.

Mr. Silveyra explained, on those, as you can see, we did not change the proportion on those. What we did do was replace with the new window. To ensure the windows match like the other ones, we will set the windows back four inches, do the whole wood frame, the cross, the wood frame on the south and the molding outside, solid wood also.

Vice-Chairman Lopez clarified Mr. Silveyra would not be changing any windows, just recess them and adding the muntins or moldings.

Mr. Silveyra agreed and asked commissioners if they would approve that because of the energy efficiency.

Vice-Chairman Lopez explained there are other energy efficient windows that Mr. Silveyra could match or try to match this one.

Mr. Silveyra explained the previous property owner randomly replaced windows; some windows would open sideways, some windows would open others would not. It was the wooden cross, with single pane glass; I guess they would replace the window with any window that would fit. There is no uniformity.

Commissioner Gomez explained Mr. Silveyra purchased the property as it was but after making improvements Mr. Silveyra should bring the structure back to the way it was originally intended. The fact that the previous windows opened every which way and now Mr. Silveyra has installed *whatever* windows does not make it right.

Mr. Silveyra understood and asked commissioners for their help to correct the situation.

Chairman Helm stated the way the original windows appear to be is actually a pair of windows to match the pair of doors that was on the ground floor. So, it is a pair of double hung that was the same, scale-wise, with the same dimension as the pair of doors below it. So, it's more than just a divided light.

# **City Council**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez



# **City Council**

District 1 Ann Morgan Lilly

> District 2 Larry Romero

District 3 Emma Acosta

District 4 Carl L. Robinson

District 5 Dr. Michiel R. Noe

> District 6 Claudia Ordaz

> > District 7 Lily Limón

District 8 Cortney C. Niland

# **City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

# **Economic & International Development Department**

Mr. Silveyra agreed with the Chairman; additionally, he reiterated the previous windows were randomly installed, some opened sideways, some opened and others would not open at all.

Commissioner Moses asked Mr. Silveyra if all the apartments would have operable windows.

Mr. Silveyra replied yes sir, they all do, that is another reason. When we replaced the windows in the back, they were just three large windows, each apartment and we replaced the middle one for emergency access, or something.

Commissioner Moses clarified the middle window is operable.

Mr. Silveyra responded yes sir. Per the rendering, we proposed darkening that out so it would have the same aesthetics as the other, while functionally having the operable window.

Commissioner Gomez reiterated the outer windows will be picture windows while the middle window will be the operable one.

Mr. Silveyra responded correct, yes sir.

Chairman Helm asked Mr. Silveyra if there was a minimum of one window per sleeping space or bedroom.

Mr. Silveyra explained that is the way we did it, yes sir. He was unsure if this window configuration was in the code.

#### **A/C GRILLES**

Mr. Silveyra stated he would paint the a/c grilles to match the existing structure. When he purchased the property, there were two random holes on the outside of the structure. It was determined the holes had previously housed small window a/c units.

Chairman Helm asked Mr. Silveyra to elaborate on the grilles.

Mr. Silveyra replied he will replace the other two holes where the other bedroom windows were and install a refrigerated air unit like the hotel units.

Chairman Helm clarified PTAC units.

Mr. Silveyra responded yes, exactly, PTAC. The grilles will be painted the same color as the building.



Mayor

Oscar Leeser

Chairman Helm stated before there was through window units.

Mr. Silveyra explained the units were supposed to be through windows. You see those two black squares, that was where the through window units were previously.

Chairman Helm asked what the structure was comprised of, wood frame.

Mr. Silveyra answered wood frame, yes sir.

**City Council** 

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7* Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

### **RENOVATIONS - DOORS**

Mr. Silveyra explained he has no problem removing the *replacement doors (doors he installed)*. The previous doors were two, small French doors, approximately 22" to 24". He replaced the two small French doors with one large 36" wide door to be ADA compliant.

Chairman Helm asked Mr. Silveyra if he had replaced the front doors, or doors that are framed in, because they are smaller than the original openings. Chairman Helm asked Mr. Silveyra if he had changed the height of the doors.

Regarding the height, we scraped some of the concrete around the doors so they would be level. Mr. Silveyra guessed the height was the same as previously.

Mr. Silveyra explained he was proposing an architecturally similar door to ...

Vice-Chairman Lopez clarified but not dimension ...

Mr. Silveyra explained he would look for some sort of door. He stated he would need access for handicapped persons.

Commissioner Gomez clarified Mr. Silveyra previously stated the double doors would not be handicapped accessible.

Mr. Silveyra replied he was not sure if those double doors were manufactured nowadays. Those doors were less than two feet wide, each side. You would have to open one side then unlatch the top and bottom of the other side to open both sides equally. Each door was relatively thin, 20" or so inches.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Mr. Silveyra what happened to the original doors.

Mr. Silveyra responded he had thrown them away. The doors that were located at street level had significantly deteriorated, perhaps due to moisture.



**Mayor** Oscar Leeser

**City Council** 

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7 Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez Commissioner Moses asked Chairman Helm what could be done to bring the doors to some kind of scale or suitability with the historic look.

Chairman Helm explained he would have to go back and reconstruct, he would have to purchase custom sized doors to do that double-eave but it can be done. The new doors will have to be custom made.

Mr. Silveyra explained the problem will be the same, the width of the two doors. He suggested going with a 36" door with some sort of a sidelight, to simulate the original doors. He had doubts the smaller doors would pass inspection.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Mr. Silveyra if each apartment has an access or was this a central ...

Mr. Silveyra replied no sir, there is a door to each apartment.

Commissioner Moses clarified this is the only access.

Mr. Silveyra responded yes, they are small, 300 square feet apartments.

Vice-Chairman Lopez explained his concerns were with the doors; additionally, a 24" door for the main access will not be permitted by the code. Vice-Chairman Lopez offered the following two suggestions:

- 1. Custom made door, a 4'-0" door, this is a single door that looks like its two doors; or
- 2. As Mr. Silveyra suggested, a 3'-0" door with a side light

Vice-Chairman Lopez emphasized the doors will mimic exactly the way these look. This may be somewhat difficult as the proportion will now be changed with the 3'-0" plus 12" and the 12" side light will probably be very small.

Mr. Silveyra restated the suggestion that all four windows will be the same size.

Vice-Chairman Lopez explained that will be impossible because the 3'-0"door will have bigger windows than the side light.

Mr. Silveyra suggested three panels with the side window, similar size panel.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Mr. Silveyra if he was considering custom made doors.



# **Economic & International Development Department**

Mr. Silveyra responded he did not know where to get custom made doors but he would research that, if that is what the commissioners want.

Vice-Chairman Lopez explained it would be better if Mr. Silveyra installed four foot doors with four lights to look like the door was always there.

Mr. Silveyra explained that will be wide, but we can do this.

Chairman Helm mentioned the doors will be the same height.

Vice-Chairman Lopez added the main concern is the proportion of the door; the height is very small.

Mr. Silveyra agreed. We can do that, no problem.

DOORS - ADA COMPLIANT/ACCESSIBLE

Mr. Silveyra explained he had removed the previous doors and replaced them with 36" wide doors to comply with ADA requirements. The previous door was 44" or 46" wide, in addition to the two small French doors. He changed the width of the doors to be ADA compliant. For continuity and ADA compliance, Mr. Silveyra explained he installed wider doors throughout the structure.

Vice-Chairman Lopez explained the structure is not ADA accessible; it will be very hard for disabled persons to access the top floors.

#### **REPLACED ROOF - TWO YEARS AGO**

Mr. Silveyra explained when he replaced the roof two years ago there were pigeons inside the property. It was a mess everywhere.

Chairman Helm clarified Mr. Silveyra had already re-roofed the structure.

Mr. Silveyra responded yes, we did have permits for the roofing and the everything, yes sir. We re-roofed it when we purchased the property two years ago.

#### **PARKING**

There are four small studio apartments on the street level with parking (street level); there is parking in the rear and on River Street for the other apartments.

### VIEW OF THE MAIN FACADE

Chairman Helm asked to see the photograph of the main façade again.

City Council

District 1 Ann Morgan Lilly

> District 2 Larry Romero

District 3 Emma Acosta

District 4 Carl L. Robinson

District 5 Dr. Michiel R. Noe

> District 6 Claudia Ordaz

> > District 7 Lily Limón

District 8 Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez



# **City Council**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

# **City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

# **Economic & International Development Department**

From the photo, Ms. Velázquez explained there are garages at the ground floor, this façade is raised rather high and to the right is River Street. As you go up River Street the property becomes more level so that the rear façade is accessible.

#### FROM THE REAR OF THE PROPERTY

From the rear of the property, Commissioner Gomez asked if the doors and windows were in the exact location as the previous doors and windows.

Ms. Velázquez noted the masonry openings were still there, the openings have been modified.

Commissioner Gomez reiterated the scale was not there.

Chairman Helm added the scale and proportion were all off now. The openings of the double doors were the same size as the very large window openings. Mr. Silveyra has also removed the wood casing around the doors that would have given the doors some scale.

#### **PERMITS**

Regarding the project in its entirety, Commissioner Gomez asked Mr. Silveyra if all permits were in place.

Regarding the interior, Mr. Silveyra explained, we did not do anything major. The inspector told us to get the Certificate of Appropriateness first.

Commissioner Gomez clarified so the permits were in place?

Mr. Silveyra responded no, when we replaced the windows, no sir, unfortunately, no.

#### **RAMPS**

Chairman Helm asked Mr. Silveyra if was building new ramps up to those doors.

Mr. Silveyra explained no, the studio apartment doors are level with the parking lot. He speculated the logs, as shown in the photograph, were used as guides for the parking lot.

#### DISCUSSION AMONGST COMMISSIONERS AND MR. SILVEYRA

Chairman Helm stated he agreed with Commissioner Lopez about the four doors being probably the best option.

Mr. Silveyra stated he could do that.

Vice-Chairman Lopez suggested Mr. Silveyra go to a carpenter or someone who does cabinetry.



Mayor

Oscar Leeser

**City Council** 

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7* Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez Chairman Helm asked if there is a wood door manufacturer in El Paso.

Mr. Silveyra stated he would look into that, he would look at the original size of the hole, 46" or 48", the exact same size. We still have the original opening; we will find the original dimension, no problem.

Vice-Chairman Lopez cautioned Mr. Silveyra be aware, today, you tell the commission you will follow our recommendations but we if find out later you completely changed everything ...

Mr. Silveyra responded he would bring the pictures to the commission/Ms. Velázquez for approval, first, after talking to the carpenter.

Chairman Helm suggested tabling the request to the next meeting to allow Mr. Silveyra time to come back with a revised proposal.

Vice-Chairman Lopez added for the doors and the window detail.

Mr. Silveyra agreed. As far as the detail for the windows, he proposed to set them in and put the molding in. He thought he would have to build one. Mr. Silveyra suggested he build one then bring it to commissioners for approval.

Vice-Chairman Lopez suggested Mr. Silveyra bring a mock up, you do not have to do the entire window, just a small corner. Tell the carpenter to do a 4" stream and recess 2" and then the window, even if you bring a photograph.

Chairman Helm wondered how much it is going to be set back.

Regarding the picture windows, Mr. Silveyra asked commissioners if the 4" would be enough.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Mr. Silveyra how thick the wall was.

Mr. Silveyra replied that is a funny question, this was previously a house so, one side of the structure is 4" or 6"; however, the other side is 20". It is a whole solid wood frame. It would not be a problem to slide the window in, put the actual wood molding ...

Chairman Helm stated it's 20" and it's not a masonry structure?

Mr. Silveyra explained on one side it is, but on the other side it was not.



Mayor

Oscar Leeser

Commissioner Gomez understood there was brick on one side.

Mr. Silveyra yes on the one side, on the inside of the wall yes.

Commissioner Gomez continued the walls are brick.

**City Council** 

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2 Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

*District 7* Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager Tommy Gonzalez Mr. Silveyra explained it is 2'x4' by 2'x4' by 2'x4'; it is solid wood, the molding, the actual frame. It would not be a problem to slide it in and do the 4" frame.

Referring to the original plans, Chairman Helm stated looks like a 6" frame in the before picture with a 6" setback, minimum.

Mr. Silveyra clarified to the edge of the molding outside; we can do that.

Vice-Chairman Lopez replied yes, it is a little bit deeper than before. Additionally, those streams around the window outside can be 4" around.

Mr. Silveyra clarified 4" around the cross.

Chairman Helm noted those casings look bigger than four.

Vice-Chairman Lopez referred to the casings that surround.

Chairman Helm responded the surround.

Mr. Silveyra replied, on the wall, he was thinking they would be like 6", too.

Looking at the proposed plan, Vice-Chairman Lopez explained the eave would provide a point of reference. He then clarified the eave is approximately 6".

Mr. Silveyra reiterated so that would be 6" set in and 6" of wood frame, regarding the cross, will that be 6" as well.

Vice-Chairman Lopez thought the cross was lower.

Mr. Silveyra thought it was similar, but would not go all the way to 4".

Vice-Chairman Lopez continued it is a lot smaller, maybe 3".

Mr. Silveyra thought 3" was too small.



Mayor

Oscar Leeser

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked Mr. Silveyra if he had a builder.

Mr. Silveyra explained it was just himself and a worker.

**City Council** 

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6 Claudia Ordaz

> *District 7* Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez Vice-Chairman Lopez explained the worker could buy 2'x 6' and do a corner, take a picture or bring the picture over here. Then do the moldings in the center, this it will be 3" and the horizontal is 4".

Mr. Silveyra clarified you want me to do a mockup of the corner of the windows, take a picture and bring it to you.

Vice-Chairman Lopez explained just the corner so you don't spend money.

Mr. Silveyra added and you can see the dimensions.

Vice-Chairman Lopez continued if you do a window and put a molding on it, where it is open 4" and the other 3" so we can see which is better the 3" or 4".

Mr. Silveyra replied he could do that. As far as the molding width, he was thinking 1" or 1.5" as far as it sticks out, it is sticking out from the actual buildings. He thought it was 4"x1", basically.

Vice-Chairman Lopez clarified you are going to leave those windows or put new windows then put moldings on the front, correct.

Mr. Silveyra replied yes sir.

Vice-Chairman Lopez continued so the window works independently behind.

Mr. Silveyra replied correct, yes sir.

Per the code, Vice-Chairman Lopez cautioned Mr. Silveyra just remember you need to have certain openings for bedrooms for fire escape. If you do not comply with you may only have to do the top muntin and leave the opening on the bottom.

Mr. Silveyra understood the fire safety concern. He questioned without the cross or just the cross on the top and leave the bottom one.

Vice-Chairman Lopez continued Mr. Silveyra must verify what size window openings you must have for fire escape, per the code.



**Mayor** Oscar Leeser

Mr. Silveyra understood, he explained so they could have access. In the event of a fire, it would not actually swing up with the window when they open it.

**City Council** 

Mr. Silveyra explained those are small, one bedroom, studio apartments, I mean it is not like it's the same thing, okay. I will definitely do that.

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

Vice-Chairman Lopez interrupted saying you have to have a fire escape.

District 2
Larry Romero

For the permit, Chairman Helm explained, the fire escape is required.

District 3
Emma Acosta

Mr. Silveyra noted for the bottom one to ...

District 4

Commissioner Gomez asked if I could go back to small double-hungs.

Carl L. Robinson

Chairman Helm responded no, now that they are gone, no.

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

#### IN CONCLUSION

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

Chairman Helm asked Mr. Silveyra if he would like commissioners to defer the request for a couple weeks to allow you time to do what you need to do. You can present your material for review and/or approval at the next meeting.

*District 7* Lily Limón Mr. Silveyra approved. He asked if he would bring a mockup of the windows only, not the doors.

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

Chairman Helm replied just the windows; however, for the doors, you will need to submit a revised plan.

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez Regarding the doors, Vice-Chairman Lopez added or bring us copies from whoever will be doing the revised plan with dimensions for the openings and the trim ...

Mr. Silveyra responded he could do that, he would get the dimensions from the pictures so the doors will be the same. He reiterated the best solution will be one door to fit the opening, very large but aesthetically this is the best option.

Chairman Helm advised Mr. Silveyra to look as close to the original.

Mr. Silveyra replied he would do that, definitely.

Chairman Helm asked if commissioner had any further comments and/or questions. He asked Ms. Velázquez if commissioners needed to take action to defer the request to the next meeting.



# **City Council**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7* Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

# **City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

# **Economic & International Development Department**

Ms. Velázquez responded yes, the next HLC meeting will be March 9<sup>th</sup>. She requested commissioners make a motion to postpone the request to the next meeting and that Mr. Silveyra bring back the things commissioners had requested.

Chairman Helm asked Ms. Velázquez if commissioners should make a motion and vote.

Ms. Velázquez replied yes, why don't we say you do that.

#### **MOTION:**

Motion made by Chairman Helm TO POSTPONE THIS CASE UNTIL THE NEXT HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING FOR REVIEW.

With the city permits, Mr. Silveyra asked commissioners if he could work on the door openings to make them back to the original size.

For Mr. Silveyra, Ms. Velázquez explained commissioners have not taken any action they have just postponed the request. The next HLC meeting will be March 9th; at that time you will present your documents and materials as requested by the commission. Until Mr. Silveyra does have the approval from this commission, she recommended Mr. Silveyra not do any work on the property.

Mr. Silveyra asked if he could work on the windows, for now.

Ms. Velázquez recommended Mr. Silveyra not do any work on the property. She suggested Mr. Silveyra be present at the March 9<sup>th</sup> meeting with recommended documentation and materials for presentation to the commission.

Vice-Chairman Lopez clarified Mr. Silveyra could renovate the interior of the structure not the exterior.

Ms. Velázquez agreed with Vice-Chairman Lopez.

Mr. Silveyra summed up:

- 1. I will bring you a mockup of the windows, a sort of picture of the mockup of the window;
- 2. So the door, we won't touch the opening, so you want me to work on the openings meanwhile.

Vice-Chairman Lopez requested Mr. Silveyra not touch the window openings.

Mr. Silveyra clarified he was not to touch the door openings until he has spoken with a carpenter.



**Mayor** Oscar Leeser

Vice-Chairman Lopez replied yes; additionally, Mr. Silveyra must submit plans or something explaining how you're going to address that and to include sizes, dimensions, trims, etc.

**City Council** 

Chairman Helm added material, what size the door will be when Mr. Silveyra is finished.

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

Mr. Silveyra stated he would look at the original opening and make it the same, see what his carpenter can do to make it look as similar to the original as possible.

District 2
Larry Romero

Chairman Helm requested Mr. Silveyra look for a wood door to match as much as possible.

District 3
Emma Acosta

Mr. Silveyra replied yes, definitely, they need to be custom-made doors.

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

#### MOTION;

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Gomez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO POSTPONE THIS CASE UNTIL THE NEXT HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING FOR REVIEW.

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

**3.** Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. February 23, 2015 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the March 9, 2015 meeting. March 9, 2015 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be schedule for the March 23, 2015 meeting.

District 7 Lily Limón

No requests from commissioners.

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

#### **HLC Staff Report**

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez **4.** Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A")

*No comments/questions from commissioners.* 

#### **MOTION:**

Motion made by Commissioner Moses, seconded by Commissioner Lucero AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE HLC STAFF REPORT.

#### Other Business - Discussion and Action

5. Discussion on Downtown survey and map (per 11.24.2014 meeting discussion) including

Economic & International Development

City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094

ED@elpasotexas.gov

Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



#### Mayor

Oscar Leeser

#### **City Council**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

# **Economic & International Development Department**

discussion of Certified Local Government (CLG) grant.

Ms. Velázquez happily informed commissioners she received a letter today from the Texas Historical Commission confirming the award of a Certified Local Government (CLG) grant for \$56,000.00. The next step is to wait for the contract to come in the mail to see what the conditions are.

Regarding estimates to do the survey, Ms. Velázquez has spoken with three firms:

- 1. Mead and Hunt (Austin, Tx) has decided to wait to see what we are going to do before submitting an estimate;
- 2. Valenzuela Preservation (Austin, Tx)
- 3. HDR (Dallas, Tx)

The proposal has not changed because of the grant; we still have to find the matching \$56,000.00 funds. Because we have been awarded this grant, we are not going to pursue the other grant, The Texas Preservation Trust Fund Grant. The Texas Preservation Trust Fund Grant due date was February 27, 2015. We had to submit a more detailed application and then wait to hear from them to see if we were awarded that grant.

We have decided to stick with the one grant from CLG Fund and not submit for the other grant.

Chairman Helm asked Ms. Velázquez what the next step is.

Ms. Velázquez replied the next step is waiting for the contract to come in the mail and see what the conditions are. The deadline to complete the survey is September 16, 2015.

Ms. Velázquez discovered a HABS (Historic American Building Survey) was done of Segundo Barrio back in the 80s. We think this survey was done in preparation for a National Register nomination that was never completed. I contacted the Texas Historical Commission about this and was told they have correspondence regarding the survey on file; however, in the early 90s it just died because they never heard back from the city. This is a not a new idea that we are doing but we hope to be more successful this time.

Chairman Helm asked Ms. Velázquez when the HABS survey was done.

Ms. Velázquez responded late 1980s; 1988 or 1989 but by 1991 there was no further correspondence.

Chairman Helm remembered having a conversation with Mr. Geoffrey Wright who said he and Fred Dalbin worked on the same project; they worked on the survey back around that time.



#### Mayor

Oscar Leeser

#### **City Council**

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

*District 4*Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*Claudia Ordaz

*District 7* Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

# **City Manager** Tommy Gonzalez

# **Economic & International Development Department**

Chairman Helm suggested Ms. Velázquez check with Mr. Wright.

Chairman Helm reiterated we still have to look for local sources of funding to match the grant.

Ms. Velázquez replied yes, we do. Furthermore, as far as the contract, Ms. Velázquez was unaware what the timeline was to collect the matching funds; she was hoping the deadline was September 16<sup>th</sup>.

- 6. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for:
  - a. January 26, and
  - b. February 9, 2015

#### **JANUARY 26, 2015**

Chairman Helm asked commissioners if they had any additions/corrections/revisions for staff.

No comments/questions from commissioners.

#### **FEBRUARY 9, 2015**

Chairman Helm asked commissioners if they had any additions/corrections/revisions for staff.

#### PAGE 12 of 34, second to last sentence

Commissioner Lucero requested staff revise the sentence as follows:

Mr. Martinez asked if he could email photos of the brick or would he need to actually brick bring the physical brick.

#### **MOTION:**

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Gomez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES FOR JANUARY 26<sup>TH</sup> AND FEBRUARY 9<sup>TH</sup> WITH CORRECTIONS AS INDICATED.

-----

#### **MOTION:**

Motion made by Commissioner Lucero, seconded by Commissioner Moses AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 5:11 P.M.